

**REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESULTS OF  
ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL  
ACCREDITATION OF ORGANISATIONS FOR CONTINUING  
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (CPD) FOR HEALTHCARE  
PROFESSIONALS**

**LIMITED LIABILITY PARTNERSHIP  
EDUCATIONAL- CLINICAL CENTER ASTANA**

**Composition of External Expert Commission**

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No.19 dated January 28, 2019 formed External Expert Committee (EEC) for conducting accreditation of Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA» on February 12-13, 2019, as follows:



**Chairman -**

**Uteuliev Yerzhan Sabitalievich**

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Master of Business Administration in the specialty "Public Health", Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs and Scientific and Innovative Activities of Kazakhstan Medical University "VSHOZ", Almaty



**Foreign expert - Yesayan Ashot Movsesovich**

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Nephrology and Dialysis of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education of the First St. Petersburg State Medical University. Acad. I.P.Pavlova, Member of the Board of the Scientific Society of Nephrologists of Russia, member of the Board, Eurasian Association of Therapists, member of the Russian Cardiological Society, member of the International Society of Nephrologists (ISN), member of the European Association of Nephrologists, Transplantologists, Dialysis Physicians (ERA-EDTA), member of the European Society of Cardiology (ESC)



**National expert - Kemelova Gulshat Seitmuratovna,**  
PhD, director of the Center of Practical Skills of the University  
of Karaganda State Medical University, Karaganda



**Expert - representative of practical health care  
Kaliyeva Maral Ashirapovna**  
Head of the Continuing Professional Development  
Department of the RSE Medical Centre Hospital of the  
President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of  
Kazakhstan”, Astana



**Expert - representative of the Healthcare Professionals –  
Aubakirova Nagima Sadykovna,**  
Deputy Chief Physician for Quality Control of Medical  
Services of the City Polyclinic No. 1 of Astana, Physician of  
the Highest Category, Excellence in Public Health of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan



**ECAQA observer - Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna**  
M.D., Dr of MSc, MBA  
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance  
in Higher Education and Health care,  
Director General

In the period from 01.12.2018 to 20.01.2019, the conformity assessment of the activity of the Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA» to the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals of ECAQA was carried out.

The EEC report contains an assessment of Educational-Clinical Center «ASTANA» for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of medical organizations of supplementary education of the ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of the activities of the organization of supplementary education.

The national institutional accreditation of the organization of additional education has not yet been carried out. International accreditation was carried out in 2018 by the European Society for Simulation Training in Medicine / Society in Europe for Simulation Applied to Medicine (SESAM), the certificate validity period for 2018-2023.

### **General part of the Final Report of the EEC**

Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA» was established within the framework of the implementation of the State program of reforming and developing the health care of the city of Astana for 2008-2010 by Resolution of Astana Akim of October 22, 2007 No. 18-961P with 100% state participation. The center was created in collaboration with the medical corporation "Partners Health Care System" (Boston, USA), which is the clinical base of Harvard Medical School. The center was equipped with mannequins and models. Coaches of the Center were prepared on the basis of the Stratus simulation center (Boston, USA).

Akimat of Astana transferred the Center to the competitive environment and since 2013, realizing the state policy of Kazakhstan in the field of public-private partnership for 2011-2015, the Center continued its activities in the framework of PPP. And since 2015, the Center has acquired the status of a private enterprise. In 2016, a rebranding of the Center was conducted at Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA».

Since the beginning of the activity, the main efforts have been directed towards the creation of a simulation training center at the Center not only in Astana, but also in the RK, which will train practitioners in international standards. Programs of the American Heart Association (AHA) were translated into Russian and Kazakh languages and successfully implemented in the educational process. This was a necessity dictated by the current situation in the domestic healthcare system, when it was very important to bring our medicine to a new level, to introduce international standards more widely, including working out and improving the practical skills of our medical workers.

Medical instructors of the Center received special training in simulation centers in the USA, Israel, Italy, Singapore and other countries, have international certificates of trainers. Foreign specialists conducted master classes in Astana, and now for several years, the Center has been successfully conducting courses in emergency medical care in accordance with international standards.

Center Achievements:

State certification of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 5 years (Pr. No. 100 dated February 12, 2014);

International Accreditation of the European Society of Simulation Training in Medicine (SESAM) for 2018-2023;

registered rights to 15 intellectual property items;

National business rating "Industry Leader 2013-2016";

- "Leader of the Year 2017-2018gg." "Pride of Education 2016.»;
  - National Business Rating "Best Company 2016.";
  - "Sapa zhuldyz 2016 .;
  - Membership in the International Society of simulation technologies in education:
    - A simulation of pan-Asian community in healthcare (PASSH);
    - European Society of a simulation training in medicine (SESAM);
    - International group of pediatric simulation (GISP);
    - A simulation of the Russian education in medicine (ROSOMED);
  - Memorandums of cooperation with leading universities and clinics abroad (USA, Korea, Lithuania, Russia, Singapore, Malaysia, Finland, etc.);
  - . Employ trainers, certified by international accredited organizations (European Resuscitation Council (the ERC), the American Heart Association (AHA) ECC Instructors have hands-on experience in clinical medicine for at least 10 years, the highest and the first qualification category;
  - Patent to organize and conduct annual national competitions ambulances;
  - Annual state order UZ Astana;
  - Since 2016 collaborates with the national airline AirAstana teaching flight attendants first aid;
  - volunteers conducted training International specialized exhibition "EXPO-2017" and the 28th World Winter Universiade-2017;
  - Since 2016. is the initiator and main organizer of national competitions ambulance crews;
  - Produce its own newspaper "Herald ECC", 6000 copies.
  - Implemented the task of dissemination of advanced medical knowledge and technologies introduced in Astana, the regional health. Since 2014 the Center opened branches in all regions of Kazakhstan. Today has 15 subsidiaries in the regions, who in 2018 became an independent organization with legal registration
- From 2007 to present, the Center trained more than 50 000 people, conducted more than 150 training sessions and workshops with the participation of foreign experts.

## **2. Self Assessment Analysis of Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA» for compliance with institutional report Accreditation Standards**

Self-Assessment Report on Educational-Clinical Center «ASTANA» (TCC) is represented by 115 pages, excluding attachments, characterized completeness, structuring and internal unity information provided by ECC. A cover letter signed by the Director General of ECC Musina R.R. is attached to the report, confirming the authenticity of the information and data contained in the report.

ECC self-assessment carried out on the basis of the order number from 12 to "On carrying out the National Accreditation".

The report written by competent language, the language of each standard are clear and understandable, tables contain references in the text and are numbered consecutively.

### **The level and quality of introspection of Center**

Based on the analysis of self-evaluation by experts, it was found that self-assessment report content structured according to standard institutional accreditation additional medical educational organizations (CPD).

The report written by literate language, the language of each standard clear and understandable, table comprise references in the text and are numbered consecutively. There are references to the regulations, rules and standard documents of ECC.

Self-esteem and the description made in accordance with institutional standards accreditation criteria of additional medical educational organizations (CPD) and ECAQA received answers to the questions set forth in the Guidelines for self-assessment. By all standards of the Center given the real practice, arguments, examples, confirming compliance with the accreditation standards. Description of TCC activities based on accreditation standards fairly complete, actualized (by number listeners information the recruitment of students, the results of input and final inspection, monitoring, based on feedback, financial information, international cooperation, etc.).

The report given in the standard 8.1.1 SWOT analysis, which includes a description of strengths and weaknesses, areas for improvement. In accordance with the requirements of the Guide to the self-assessment to the ECAQA report, accompanied by copies of the documents, which complement the description of the accreditation standards.

Thus, the self-assessment report Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA» center contains an objective, detailed and at the same time, partially repeated information on all activities in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation ECAQA.

### **3. Analysis for compliance institutional accreditation standards for the external evaluation of ECC and review the strengths of each standard**

#### **Standard 1: Mission and Outcomes**

The Center was established 11 years ago and now has passed the state certification voluntarily MES and international accreditation as a simulation center. The mission of the organization and a stable position in the field of continuing professional development in health care, supported by co-operation with Kazakhstan and international partners, the strategic development plan and monitoring its implementation. The demand for advanced training and certifications programs are flexible and individual approach to development.

#### ***Strengths:***

- The presence of the mission and strategic goals, justify the need for the passage of a voluntary state certification in 2014 and the accreditation of the European Society of a simulation training in medicine (SESAM) to 2023;

- The Center is a member of the National Health Chamber of Astana;
- Is the initiator of the creation of 15 subsidiaries, as part of the policy head of state: the transfer of the experience of Astana in the region;
- Well-established national and international cooperation and membership in various international associations of simulation training;
- All intellectual property rights in 15 training programs.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 13 correspond partly - 0 not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. to inform about the mission and its stakeholders who involved in the development of the Center;

## **Standard 2: Educational programmes**

In accordance with the program documents and policies in the area of additional education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in the Center has implemented a variety of training programs, certification courses, short-term training activities, with emphasis on training in a medical emergency. Additional education provided teaching materials and simulation equipment. The programs are developed according to the needs of practical health care.

**Strengths:**

- Modern simulation center, which introduced a diverse range of training programs and international courses BLS, ACLS, PALS, PHTLS, Triage;
- Doctors instructors professionally own all educational programs and contribute to the improvement of methods of simulation training;
- accounting practical health care needs by working closely with Office of Public Health of Astana, National Chamber of Astana Health Association clinic in Almaty, Astana professional associations, Union a simulation training and independent examination in medicine;
- High demand for training programs among health professionals, paramedical and non-medical workers.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 18 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2: Completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To unify all forms of educational materials with the subsequent approval by Methodical Council;
2. To record changes and additions to the work program based on the analysis of questionnaires of students and employers in order to update a practical health care needs of these programs;
3. To include a system of rating estimations of knowledge and skills acquired during training to the training programs.

### **Standard 3: Assessment and Documentation**

Methods for assessing trainees include determining the initial level of knowledge and final control, which are documented in accordance with the requirements for additional education. Feedback is applied through questionnaires and monitoring the survival of students' knowledge. For objectivity of an assessment and increase of efficiency of educational programs, mutual attendance of classes by teachers is carried out.

#### ***Strengths:***

- a variety of teaching materials are developed and applied in the center (movies, presentations, algorithms, protocols, handouts, tests, tasks);
- when analyzing the final results are positive feedback from the students and employers;
- The Center introduced document 24 in the Bitrix system.

***EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** correspond - 6 correspond partly - 1 do not correspond - 0.

#### ***Standard 3: Completed***

#### ***Recommendations for improvement:***

1. It is advisable to develop an additional education program evaluation policy by developing a map of competencies and knowledge assessment tools;
2. To form a portfolio of teachers with a personal growth plan;
3. To conduct improving pedagogical skills of teachers using innovative learning technologies;
4. To develop a mechanism for evaluating the quality of educational programs.

### **Standard 4: The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)**

Various approaches are used to attract students, which are provided by academic counseling. Programs are being implemented that meet the requirements for the training of health professionals and are based on clinical data. The Center contributes to the development of students' ability to plan, carry out and document their training. Additional education programs are based on modern educational strategies, including simulations, taking into account the individuality of learning. The organization of independent work of students provides for various forms, including elements of remote work. Considering that the activities of the Center are provided mainly by the state order and the local budget for advanced training programs for healthcare professionals, it is necessary to search for other sources for the development of the center, the implementation of paid programs.

#### ***Strengths:***

- The Center has a reputation among the leaders of Astana and health professionals medical organizations, as a provider of quality education;
- System marketing work carried out by the center to attract the audience;
- Positive feedback from employers, students, sharing positive information among experts previously trained in our center, to create a center image, providing high-quality training;

- Flexible pricing policy and adapted to the students schedule classes.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 19 correspond partly -0 not correspond - 0.

**Standard 4: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. It is advisable to conducting primary questioning and listening test for the formation of groups based on the level of competence and experience in the specialty.

### **Standard 5: CPD PROVISION (continuing professional development)**

The Center provides a system of assessment and recognition of their training programs through adherence to state requirements in the organization of the NDP and initiated an institutional accreditation by the accreditation body recognized by the MES. Activity ECC is transparent and flexible, reinforced corporate governance (Supervisory board) and electronic document uniting 15 be affiliated teaching and clinical centers. When planning and implementing KCA programs demonstrates the use of effective and efficient methods of training and simulation technologies.

**Strengths:**

- Continuously improve the level of vocational training with the participation of leading national and international experts (RTSRZ MOH, ultrasonic Kazakhstan, Russia Moscow, Baku, Azerbaijan, Lithuania, Rome Italy, Israel, Sweden, Turkey, Austria.);
- Teachers of simulation centers have professional certificates; settle down, the first and highest category, international certificates of master classes: BLS, ACLS, PALS, PHTLS.
- Professionalism, the ability to properly organize the workflow;
- Management and administration of the Center creates a favorable psychological atmosphere, an individual approach to each employee made additional payments and allowances for special working conditions, a one-time premium, the premium as a result of the current activities of the Center during the reporting period.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 12 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. To ensure ongoing improvement of pedagogical skills of teachers;

### **Standard 6: Educational resources**

The Center has a stable material and technical base for practical training and clinical training of students. Nine clinical sites contribute to the effective implementation of programs. Access to professional literature is provided through an agreement with the library of the medical school, links to international sources. There is a informative and constantly updated bilingual website. Information and communication technologies are



used as an integrated part of training (electronic testing, survey, access to computers, webinars, online conferences, video calls, etc.). The Center strives to implement multidisciplinary training. Employees of the Center actively participate in expert work and formulate proposals for improving additional education. The Center implements training at alternative clinical bases and centers (international retreats, workshops, exchange of experience, etc.). The organization's leadership has established contractual relationships with national, regional and international organizations to promote the promotion and mutual recognition of CPD programs.

***Strengths:***

- The Center is located on two bases – RSE REM «Municipal Ambulance Station" and the head office of the enterprise total area of which is 524.8 m<sup>2</sup>;
- There are 9 clinical sites, which have signed a cooperation agreement.
- The Center is equipped with multimedia installations, dummies and dummies advanced firms («Laerdal» (Norway), «Nasco» (USA), «Kyoto» (Japan) «Doctor Medicinae» (China), etc .;
- The Center cooperates with medical schools, clinics, specialists with experience in simulation education (SESAM GISP. PASSH, ROSOMED).

***EEC conclusions on the criteria:*** correspond to - 24 correspond partly -0 not correspond - 0.

***Standard 6: Completed***

***Recommendations for improvement:***

1. To provide students online access to electronic resources of the library MUA;
2. To develop their own brand of the Center;
3. To publish the achievements and results of the Center's work in refereed journals;
4. To participate in joint research projects with partners from the practical health care and foreign partners.

**Standard 7: Evaluation of CPD Activities**

The Center permanently collect information from health care professionals, the results of which are analyzed and taken appropriate measures to create training and thematic short courses programs. The results of the survey and the survey allow listeners to evaluate the training program, and are available to members of the Supervisory Board, members of the organization and the listeners themselves. The assessment involved the main stakeholders.

***Strengths:***

- Methodological Council carries out monitoring and analysis of CPD evaluation of data;
- During the course, instructors use actual and final feedback, as well as the different methods by which you can get an idea of the completeness of mastery of knowledge and skills;
- Monitoring the opinions of students (questionnaires, journal reviews);
- Positive feedback on the quality of the organization of training.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 10 correspond partly -1 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7: Completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. Following the results of the analysis of the survey of students to develop a plan to improve operations and educational programs;
2. To implement a survey of heads of medical organizations to assess the quality of training health professionals.

### **Standard 8. Organization**

Organization It plans to develop and implement programs based on the mission statement and the definition of learning outcomes of students. It takes place proper management and educational programs.

**Strengths:**

- The Supervisory Board and efficient organizational structure with a network of subsidiaries in the PND regions of Kazakhstan;
- Corporate Electronic Bitrix 24 document;
- Annual state order for 11 years.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond - 9 correspond partially - 0 do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 8: Completed**

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1. Continued involvement of specialists from the leading medical education with clinical experience;
2. Training of employees of methodical work.

### **Standard 9. Continuous Renewal**

The Center systematically initiates the evaluation of its activities as the departmental institutions (state. certification of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2014, the Ministry of Education), International Accreditation Center (the SESAM 2018), the national accreditation body (2019), as well as regularly review and update process, organizational structure, content , outcomes, assessment methods and educational environment of CPD programs in view of changes in the practical health needs, new regulatory documents, changes in society.

**Strengths:**

- The optimization of educational programs taking into account changes in international standards, PPA of the RoK, clinical diagnostic protocols and treatment of the RK;
- In 2018, the Center has passed the international accreditation «SESAM», as a result of which it is planned further joint activity, taking into account their recommendations and the development of research work.

**EEC conclusions on the criteria:** correspond to - 5 correspond partly - 0 do not correspond - 0.

***Standard 9: Completed***  
***Recommendation no.***

**4. Recommendations on improvement of Educational-Clinical Center «ASTANA»:**

- 1) To inform about the mission and its stakeholders who involved in the development of the Center;
- 2) To unify educational materials and accounting documents;
- 3) To improve policy assessment of additional education programs;
- 4) To ensure ongoing improvement of pedagogical skills of teachers;
- 5) To intensify efforts to participate in research projects;
- 6) Greater use of feedback results with students to improve educational programs.

**5. The EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA» as an additional education organization for 5 years.**

Chairman	Uteuliev Yerzhan Sabitalievich
Foreign expert	Yesayan Ashot Movsesovich
National expert	Kemelova Gulshat Seitmuratovna
National expert	Kemelova Gulshat Seitmuratovna
Expert -representative of practical health care	Kaliyeva Maral Ashirapovna
Expert - representative of the Healthcare Professionals	Aubakirova Nagima Sadykovna
ECAQA observer	Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna

**• Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА**

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать Учебно-клинический центр «Астана» в качестве организации дополнительного образования сроком на 5 лет.

**Председатель ВЭК** Утеулиев Ермак Сабиталиевич



**Члены ВЭК:**

**Зарубежный эксперт** Есаян Ашот Мовсесович



**Национальный академический эксперт**

Кемелова Гульшат Сейтмуратовна



**Эксперт-представитель практического здравоохранения**

Калиева Марал Аспирановна



**Эксперт-слушатель**

Лубакирова Нагима Садыковна



**Наблюдатель от ЕЦА**

Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна



**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation supplementary education  
(Educational- Clinical Center «ASTANA»)**

standard	Criteria for evaluation	evaluation		
		Meets	Complies partially	Does not match
1.	Mission and Outcomes	13	0	0
2.	Educational programme	18	1	0
3.	Assessment and Documentation	6	1	0
4.	The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)	19	0	0
5.	CPD PROVISION (Continuous Professional Development)	12	0	0
6.	Educational resources	24	0	0
7.	Evaluation of CPD Activities	10	1	0
8.	Organization	9	0	0
9.	Continuous Renewal	5	0	0
	<b>Total</b>	<b>116</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>0</b>